Cobre Valley Institute of Technology

18-Month Followup of Performance Audit Report 23-207

The December 2023 Cobre Valley Institute of Technology performance audit found that the District spent $1.4 million on career and technical education (CTE) programs in fiscal year 2021 but lacked key outcome data showing these programs effectively prepared students for high-need occupations. We made **2** recommendations to the District.

District's status in implementing 2 recommendations

Implementation status	Number of recommendations
In process	1 recommendation
Not yet applicable	1 recommendation

We will conduct a 30-month followup with the District on the status of the recommendations that have not yet been implemented.

Arizona Auditor General
Cobre Valley Institute of Technology | September 2025 | 18-Month Followup of Report 23-207, December 2023

1

Recommendations to the District

Finding 1: District's lack of key outcome data prevents it from demonstrating how the $1.4 million it spent on programs in fiscal 2021 effectively prepared students for high-need occupations.

1. The District should develop and implement consistent data collection protocols for all CTE programs to demonstrate compliance with statutory and ADE requirements and recommended practices. This includes collecting and validating complete data, such as data related to student certifications earned and post-graduate jobs obtained, as well as developing a process to track all outcome data.

   ▶ Status: **Implementation in process.**

   Although the District developed and implemented consistent data collection protocols across its central and satellite CTE programs related to certifications earned, additional efforts are needed related to post-graduation jobs obtained. Specifically, the District required central and satellite programs to collect and submit to the District supporting documentation for all certifications reported as earned in fiscal year 2024. In June 2025, the District used this documentation to validate the certification attainment data reported for central and satellite program students. The District reported that it worked with its central and satellite programs, as needed, to revise and resubmit certification attainment data when it identified inaccuracies during its review. We reviewed the District's documentation for all 150 certifications it reported students earned across its central and satellite programs in fiscal year 2024 and found the District's reported certifications were accurate and supported.

   However, the District has not yet taken similar steps to implement consistent data collection protocols across its central and satellite CTE programs for post-graduation placement data, nor to validate the data once it has been collected. District officials indicated that due to the relatively small program sizes and to allow flexibility in data collection, they plan to continue relying on member districts to develop and implement their own data collection protocols rather than implementing consistent protocols for all central and satellite programs. However, by doing so, the District increases the risk that its member districts' post-graduation placement data will be inaccurate and/or incomplete. The District reported that it plans to validate post-graduation placement data collected and reported by central and satellite programs by October 2025. We will review the District's data collection and validation efforts related to post-graduation placements at the 30-month followup.

2. The District should analyze all CTE program outcome data to evaluate the effectiveness of its CTE programs in preparing students for high-need occupations and to support the investment of any public monies, and use the results of its evaluations to make changes to its programs to ensure they are meeting their statutory purpose of preparing students for high-need occupations.

Arizona Auditor General
Cobre Valley Institute of Technology | September 2025 | 18-Month Followup of Report 23-207, December 2023

2

▶ Status: **Not yet applicable.**

As discussed in recommendation 1, the District has developed and implemented consistent data collection protocols for its certification attainment data but reported it does not plan to do so for its post-graduation placement data. Instead, it plans to continue allowing member districts to develop and implement their own data collection protocols and subsequently validate placement data for all central and satellite programs.

District officials reported they plan to use the student certification and post-graduation placement data to evaluate the effectiveness of central and satellite CTE programs. For instance, District officials stated that they plan to evaluate the effectiveness of the District's CTE programs by comparing yearly data to identify potential declines in certifications earned and/or CTE program-related job placements. If the analysis identifies any CTE programs with poor outcomes or programs performing below expectations, District officials indicated they planned to provide these programs with additional support to improve outcomes, such as a performance improvement plan, before considering discontinuing such programs. Because the District is still in the process of collecting and validating the outcome data needed to evaluate its CTE programs' effectiveness in preparing students for jobs in high-need occupations, we will assess the District's efforts to implement this recommendation at the 30-month followup.

Arizona Auditor General
Cobre Valley Institute of Technology | September 2025 | 18-Month Followup of Report 23-207, December 2023

3