

DEBRA K. DAVENPORT, CPA AUDITOR GENERAL

STATE OF ARIZONA OFFICE OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

WILLIAM THOMSON DEPUTY AUDITOR GENERAL

April 21, 2010

The Honorable Judy Burges, Chair Joint Legislative Audit Committee

The Honorable Thayer Verschoor, Vice Chair Joint Legislative Audit Committee

Dear Representative Burges and Senator Verschoor:

Our Office has recently completed an 18-month followup of the Washington Elementary School District's implementation status for the 18 audit recommendations (including subparts of the recommendations) presented in the performance audit report released in September 2008. As the attached grid indicates:

- 17 recommendations have been implemented; and
- 1 recommendation is in the process of being implemented.

Unless otherwise directed by the Joint Legislative Audit Committee, this report concludes our follow-up work on the District's efforts to implement the recommendations resulting from the September 2008 performance audit.

Sincerely,

Ross Ehrick, CPA Director, Division of School Audits

Enclosure

cc: Dr. Susan Cook, Superintendent Governing Board Washington Elementary School District

WASHINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL DISTRICT

Auditor General Performance Audit Report Issued September 2008 18-Month Follow-Up Report

| Recommendation | | Status/Additional Explanation | | | |
|----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| CH | CHAPTER 1: Administration | | | | |
| 1. | The District should restrict access and regularly review employees' access to its computerized accounting system to ensure their access is appropriate. | Implemented at 6 months | | | |
| 2. | The District should implement basic computer security training for its employees to inform them of the importance of security measures, such as locking computers when away from their desks to prevent unauthorized users from accessing district software and data. | Implemented at 12 months | | | |
| CH | HAPTER 2: Student transportation | | | | |
| 1. | To improve the efficiency of its student transportation program, the District should: | | | | |
| a) | Evaluate its bus driver staffing levels to determine if the number of drivers can be reduced; | Implemented at 12 months The District has reduced the number of transportation full-time equivalent (FTE) positions by 35 FTE. According to the District, this should result in a cost savings of approximately \$1.1 million. | | | |
| b) | Review rider counts throughout the year to evaluate and adjust routes to increase efficiency; and | Implemented at 18 months The District performs daily rider counts and periodically makes adjustments to routes based on the counts. | | | |
| c) | Develop and monitor performance measures, such as cost per mile, cost per rider, driver productivity, and bus capacity utilization. | Implemented at 18 months | | | |
| 2. | The District should determine whether the employee incentives available to transportation employees are cost beneficial and help to recruit and retain transportation employees. | Implemented at 12 months The District has eliminated all transportation employee incentives. | | | |
| 3. | The District should establish and maintain contracts with all of its transportation vendors and ensure that the contracts include all necessary terms and rates so that invoices can be reviewed for accuracy. | Implemented at 12 months | | | |

| Re | ecommendation | Status/Additional Explanation |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 4. | The District should maintain adequate documentation of its riders and miles, and accurately calculate and report the data needed for state funding. | Implemented at 18 months |
| 5. | The District should ensure that bus preventative maintenance is conducted and documented as specified in the Arizona Department of Public Safety's <i>Minimum Standards for School Buses and School Bus Drivers</i> and according to district policies. | Implemented at 12 months |
| 6. | The District should implement proper fleet management practices, such as ensuring that it is adequately overseeing its bus fleet's use and maintenance. | Implemented at 12 months |
| 7. | The District should maintain complete driver files and implement a procedure to ensure that all driver requirements are met in accordance with DPS Minimum Standards. | Implemented at 6 months |
| 8. | The District should discontinue using 11- to 15-passenger vans to transport students to and from school. | Implemented at 6 months |
| CH | HAPTER 3: Plant operation and maintenance | |
| | No recommendations. | |
| Cŀ | HAPTER 4: Proposition 301 monies | |
| 1. | The District's Proposition 301 plan should specify an amount or a range of performance pay each eligible employee can earn if performance criteria are met. | Implemented at 6 months |
| CH | HAPTER 5: Classroom dollars | |
| | No recommendations. | |
| _ | | |

| Re | ecommendation | Status/Additional Explanation |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| CI | HAPTER 6: Desegregation monies | |
| 1. | The District should create a desegregation plan based on findings from its past complaints and compliance review. The plan should specify the needs and goals of the desegregation program and budget monies based on these stated needs and goals. | Implemented at 6 months |
| 2. | The District should ensure that it levies desegregation monies in accordance with its plan and budget and use these monies for purposes stated in its plan. | Implemented at 6 months |
| 3. | The District should begin accounting for ELL-related desegregation costs using the correct account codes. | Implemented at 18 months |
| Cł | HAPTER 7: English Language Learner progra | ıms, costs, and funding |
| 1. | By fiscal year 2009, the District should expand its English language development instruction to align with the models adopted by the ELL Task Force in September 2007. | Implementation in process According to the District, it has implemented the ELL Task Force model to the extent possible given the current budget situation, and it has met with ADE officials to discuss its implementation of the model. However, ADE has not yet made a determination of whether the District's ELL program is in compliance with the Task Force model. |
| 2. | The District should begin separately accounting for the incremental portion of ELL costs, including those funded by desegregation monies, and retain documentation supporting how those amounts are determined. | Implemented at 18 months |