Department of Economic Security

Division of Developmental Disabilities ALTCS Contract



Lindsey A. Perry Auditor General





The Arizona Office of the Auditor General's mission is to provide independent and impartial information and specific recommendations to improve the operations of state and local government entities. To this end, the Office provides financial audits and accounting services to the State and political subdivisions, investigates possible misuse of public monies, and conducts performance audits and special reviews of school districts, state agencies, and the programs they administer.

The Joint Legislative Audit Committee

Representative Anthony Kern, Chair

Representative John Allen

Representative Rusty Bowers

Representative Rebecca Rios

Representative Athena Salman

Representative J.D. Mesnard (ex officio)

Senator Bob Worsley, Vice Chair

Senator Sean Bowie

Senator Judy Burges

Senator Lupe Contreras

Senator John Kavanagh

Senator Steve Yarbrough (ex officio)

Audit Staff

Donna Miller, Director

Victoria Fisher, Manager and Contact Person

Contact Information

Arizona Office of the Auditor General 2910 N. 44th St. Ste. 410 Phoenix, AZ 85018

(602) 553-0333

www.azauditor.gov



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Annual Financial Report

Independent auditors' report	1
Financial statements	
Balance sheet—special revenue fund	3
Statement of revenues, expenditures, and changes in fund balance—special revenue fund	4
Notes to financial statements	5
Supplementary schedules	11
Lag report for institutional care payments	12
Lag report for home- and community-based services payments	13
Lag report for acute care payments	14
Related-party transactions	15
Report on Internal Control and on Compliance	
Independent auditors' report on internal control over financial reporting and on compliance and other matters based on an audit of financial statements performed in accordance with <i>Government Auditing Standards</i>	17
Schedule of findings and recommendations	19
Financial statement findings	19
Department/Division response	
Corrective action plan	

ANNUAL FINANCIAL REPORT

ANNUAL FINANCIAL REPORT



MELANIE M. CHESNEY
DEPUTY AUDITOR GENERAL

JOSEPH D. MOORE
DEPUTY AUDITOR GENERAL

Independent auditors' report

Members of the Arizona State Legislature

Michael Trailor, Director Department of Economic Security

Report on the financial statements

We have audited the accompanying financial statements of the State of Arizona, Department of Economic Security, Division of Developmental Disabilities, Arizona Long Term Care System Contract (ALTCS Contract) as of and for the year ended June 30, 2018, and the related notes to the financial statements, which collectively comprise the Division's ALTCS Contract's financial statements as listed in the table of contents.

Management's responsibility for the financial statements

Management is responsible for the preparation and fair presentation of these financial statements in accordance with U.S. generally accepted accounting principles; this includes the design, implementation, and maintenance of internal control relevant to the preparation and fair presentation of financial statements that are free from material misstatement, whether due to fraud or error.

Auditors' responsibility

Our responsibility is to express an opinion on these financial statements based on our audit. We conducted our audit in accordance with U.S. generally accepted auditing standards and the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards*, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance about whether the financial statements are free from material misstatement.

An audit involves performing procedures to obtain audit evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the financial statements. The procedures selected depend on the auditors' judgment, including the assessment of the risks of material misstatement of the financial statements, whether due to fraud or error. In making those risk assessments, the auditors consider internal control relevant to the Division's preparation and fair presentation of the financial statements in order to design audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the Division's internal control. Accordingly, we express no such opinion. An audit also includes evaluating the appropriateness of accounting policies used and the reasonableness of significant accounting estimates made by management, as well as evaluating the overall presentation of the financial statements.

We believe that the audit evidence we have obtained is sufficient and appropriate to provide a basis for our audit opinion.

Opinion

In our opinion, the financial statements referred to above present fairly, in all material respects, the respective financial position of the Division's ALTCS Contract as of June 30, 2018, and the respective changes in financial position thereof for the year then ended in accordance with U.S. generally accepted accounting principles.

Emphasis of matter

As discussed in Note 1 to the financial statements, the Division's ALTCS Contract's financial statements are intended to present the financial position and the changes in financial position of only that portion of the governmental activities and major fund of the State of Arizona that is attributable to the Division's ALTCS Contract's transactions. They do not purport to, and do not, present fairly the financial position of the State of Arizona as of June 30, 2018, and the changes in its financial position for the year then ended in conformity with U.S. generally accepted accounting principles. Our opinion is not modified with respect to this matter.

Other matters

Supplementary information

Our audit was conducted for the purpose of forming an opinion on the financial statements that collectively comprise the Division's ALTCS Contract's financial statements. The supplementary schedules listed in the table of contents are presented for purpose of additional analysis and are not required parts of the financial statements.

The supplementary schedules are management's responsibility and were derived from and relate directly to the underlying accounting and other records used to prepare the financial statements. Such information has been subjected to the auditing procedures applied in the audit of the financial statements and certain additional procedures, including comparing and reconciling such information directly to the underlying accounting and other records used to prepare the financial statements or to the financial statements themselves, and other additional procedures in accordance with U.S. generally accepted auditing standards. In our opinion, the supplementary schedules are fairly stated, in all material respects, in relation to the financial statements as a whole.

Other reporting required by Government Auditing Standards

In accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*, we have also issued our report dated November 20, 2018, on our consideration of the Division's internal control over financial reporting and on our tests of its compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts, and grant agreements and other matters. The purpose of that report is solely to describe the scope of our testing of internal control over financial reporting and compliance and the results of that testing, and not to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the Division's internal control over financial reporting or on compliance. That report is an integral part of an audit performed in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* in considering the Division's internal control over financial reporting and compliance.

Lindsey Perry, CPA, CFE Auditor General

November 20, 2018

Department of Economic Security Division of Developmental Disabilities ALTCS Contract Balance sheet—special revenue fund June 30, 2018

Assets Due from other state funds Due from providers	\$ 122,581,446 <u>3,578,615</u>
Total assets	\$ 126,160,061
Liabilities and fund balance Liabilities: Accrued administrative and payroll costs Accrued medical and healthcare claims Due to other state funds	\$ 11,285,016 96,460,618 14,048,801
Total liabilities	121,794,435
Fund balance: Restricted for health and welfare	4,365,626
Total liabilities and fund balance	\$ 126,160,061

Department of Economic Security

Division of Developmental Disabilities ALTCS Contract Statement of revenues, expenditures, and changes in fund balance special revenue fund

Year ended June 30, 2018

Revenues:	
Capitation	\$ 1,443,374,498
Investment earnings	1,905,292
Miscellaneous	33,000,150
Total revenues	1,478,279,940
Expenditures:	
Health and welfare:	
Aid to individuals	1,306,946,723
Allocated administrative expenditures	64,727,082
Case management	65,230,704
Professional and outside services	5,906,914
Premium tax	29,503,761
Total expenditures	1,472,315,184
Excess of revenues over expenditures	5,964,756
Other financing uses:	
Transfers to other state funds	(19,192,908)
Net change in fund balance	(13,228,152)
Fund balance, July 1, 2017	17,593,778
Fund balance, June 30, 2018	\$ 4,365,626

Note 1 - Summary of significant accounting policies

The Department of Economic Security (Department), Division of Developmental Disabilities (Division), Arizona Long Term Care System Contract (ALTCS Contract), accounting policies conform to generally accepted accounting principles applicable to governmental units adopted by the Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GASB).

A. Reporting entity

For financial reporting purposes, the ALTCS Contract includes only that portion of the State's general fund that is attributable to the ALTCS Contract's transactions. The Division is responsible for administering the ALTCS Contract. Control by the Division was determined on the basis of accountability. Fiscal responsibility for the Division remains with the Department and, ultimately, with the State. The Division is a contractor with the Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System (AHCCCS) to provide medical and healthcare services to eligible enrollees of the AHCCCS Arizona Long Term Care System (ALTCS) program for the developmentally disabled. This program provides inpatient and outpatient medical and nursing services in addition to managed institutional and home- and community-based, long-term care services to eligible enrollees of the AHCCCS ALTCS program. The Division receives monthly premiums from AHCCCS for all eligible enrollees under the AHCCCS ALTCS program for the developmentally disabled.

B. Fund accounting

The Division's accounts are maintained in accordance with the principles of fund accounting to ensure that limitations and restrictions on the Division's available resources are observed. The principles of fund accounting require that resources be classified for accounting and reporting purposes into funds in accordance with the activities or objectives specified for those resources. Each fund is considered a separate accounting entity, and its operations are accounted for in a separate set of self-balancing accounts that comprise its assets, liabilities, fund balance, revenues, and expenditures.

The ALTCS Contract's financial transactions are reported as a special revenue fund since the proceeds are from specific revenue sources that are legally restricted to expenditures for specified purposes.

Although the ALTCS Contract is considered a special revenue fund when reported on individually, it becomes a part of the State's general fund at the combined state-wide level.

C. Basis of accounting

The ALTCS Contract's financial statements are reported using the current financial resources measurement focus and the modified accrual basis of accounting. Under this method, revenues are recognized when they become both measurable and available. Revenues are considered to be available when they are collected within the current period or soon enough thereafter to pay liabilities of the current period. For this purpose, the Division considers capitation revenues to be available if they are collected within 90 days of the end of the current fiscal year and considers all other revenues to be available if they are collected within 30 days of the end of the current fiscal year. All ALTCS Contract revenue sources are susceptible to accrual. Expenditures are recognized when the related fund liability is incurred.

D. Fund balance classifications

Fund balance is reported separately within classifications based on a hierarchy of the constraints placed on the use of those resources. The classifications are based on the relative strength of the constraints that control how the specific amounts can be spent. The classifications are nonspendable, restricted, and unrestricted, which includes committed, assigned, and unassigned fund balance classifications.

Restricted fund balances are those that have externally imposed restrictions on their usage by creditors, such as through debt covenants, grantors, contributors, or laws and regulations. Deficits in fund balance, if any, are reported as unassigned.

E. Capitation

The ALTCS Contract receives fixed capitation payments from AHCCCS based on certain rates for each AHCCCS member enrolled in the Division's ALTCS Contract program. The ALTCS Contract is required to provide all covered healthcare services to its members, regardless of the cost of care. If there are monies remaining, the ALTCS Contract retains the monies as profit; if the costs are higher than the amount of capitation payments from AHCCCS, the ALTCS Contract absorbs the loss.

F. Investment earnings

Investment earnings is composed of interest earned on the ALTCS Contract's portion of monies deposited with the State Treasurer.

G. Incurred but not reported (IBNR) methodology

The liability and expenditures reported for accrued medical and healthcare claims include IBNR medical claims, which are estimated using lag data provided by the Department's information systems, with adjustments as necessary for events that are outside the lag patterns. Amounts are based on historical expenditure patterns.

Note 2 - Due from other state funds

Amounts due from other state funds at June 30, 2018, include:

- \$121,822,868 of capitation and reinsurance,
- \$598,788 of interest earned, and
- \$159,790 of share of costs and miscellaneous.

Note 3 - Due from providers

The amount due from providers at June 30, 2018, is \$3,578,615 as a result of post-payment reviews of long-term care home- and community-based service providers.

Note 4 - Accrued medical and healthcare claims

Accrued medical and healthcare claims totaling \$96,460,618 include IBNR medical claims.

Note 5 - Due to other state funds

Amounts due to other state funds at June 30, 2018, include:

- \$11,172,228 of cash shortage payable to the Arizona Department of Economic Security,
- \$2,609,758 of premium tax payable to the Arizona Department of Insurance, and
- \$266,815 of assessments payable to the State's general fund.

Note 6 - Miscellaneous revenues

Miscellaneous revenues during the year ended June 30, 2018, consisted of \$33,000,000 in one-time assistance for developmental disabilities provider cost increases resulting from Laws 2017, First Regular Session, Chapter 305, Section 118, and \$150 of other revenues.

Note 7 - Acute care reinsurance

During the year ended June 30, 2018, the Division received reimbursements totaling \$4,830,546 from AHCCCS for acute care reinsurance expenditures for claims for enrollees incurred in the current and prior fiscal years. These reimbursements are recorded as a reduction of aid to individuals expenditures.

The Division subcontracts with various health plans to provide acute care services to ALTCS enrollees. These health plans must submit clean reinsurance claims to the Division within 15 months from the date of service.

The Division disbursed a total of \$7,659,313 to health plans during the year ended June 30, 2018.

Note 8 - Aid to individuals expenditures

Aid to individuals expenditures consists of expenditures summarized by type of service setting or service provided, as applicable:

Institutional	care:
Chillada	uroina

Skilled nursing	\$ 4,573,425
Institutional care	14,406,250
Intermediate (intellectually or developmentally disabled)	13,053,244
Institutional care IBNR	 2,174,760
Total institutional care	34,207,679

Home- and community-based services (HCBS):	
State-operated group home	\$ 6,171,787
Vendor-operated group home	334,455,259
Adult developmental home	63,172,825
Home-based services	583,881,281
HCBS IBNR	<u>92,583,597</u>
Total HCBS	<u>1,080,264,749</u>
Acute care:	
Acute care	187,943,267
Acute care IBNR	1,702,261
Reinsurance	7,659,313
Reinsurance reimbursement	<u>(4,830,546</u>)
Total acute care	<u>192,474,295</u>
Total aid to individuals expenditures	<u>\$1,306,946,723</u>

During the year ended June 30, 2018, the ALTCS Contract recorded allocated charges of \$22,875,677 as expenditures for direct care services, including administrative costs the Division provided to clients. The expenditures were charged to the ALTCS Contract as aid to individuals expenditures based on a federally approved cost allocation plan.

Note 9 - Allocated administrative expenditures

During the year ended June 30, 2018, the ALTCS Contract recorded allocated administrative charges of \$64,727,082 as expenditures for its share of the administrative and fiscal services the Department provided.

Note 10 - Premium tax

Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) §§36-2905 and 36-2944.01 require AHCCCS to pay a 2 percent premium tax on all capitation and other reimbursements received. These premium taxes are reported as expenditures and are paid to the Arizona Department of Insurance.

Note 11 - Transfers

Transfers to other state funds during the year ended June 30, 2018, consisted of \$12,950,000 to the state-funded long-term care fund for specified operational and programmatic expenses as a result of Laws 2017, First Regular Session, Chapter 309, Section 18; \$4,643,778 to the State's general fund as a result of A.R.S. §36-2953(H); and \$1,599,130 of interest to the state-funded long-term care fund, as authorized by AHCCCS.

Note 12 - Commitments and contingencies

The State has the ultimate fiscal responsibility for the ALTCS Contract. Accordingly, any claims requiring additional resources require the Legislature's approval. Although there is a possibility that claims could be asserted that would require additional resources for the ALTCS Contract, in the Division management's opinion, the possibility is low that valid claims will be asserted and claim amounts cannot reasonably be estimated.

Note 13 - Risk management

The Division is exposed to various risks of loss related to torts; theft of, damage to, and destruction of assets; errors and omissions; injuries to employees; medical malpractice; and natural disasters. The Department is a participant in the State's self-insurance program, and in the Division management's opinion, any unfavorable outcomes from these risks would be covered by that self-insurance program. Accordingly, the Department has no risk of loss beyond adjustments to future years' premium payments to the State's self-insurance program. All estimated losses for the State's unsettled claims and actions are determined on an actuarial basis and are included in the *State of Arizona Comprehensive Annual Financial Report*.

Note 14 – Related-party transactions

During the year ended June 30, 2018, the ALTCS Contract reimbursed the Division for \$22,875,677 of health and rehabilitative services provided to enrollees, including administrative costs. The ALTCS Contract also reimbursed the Division as well as other divisions of the Department for \$64,727,082 of administrative and fiscal services and the Arizona Department of Insurance for \$29,503,761 of premium taxes.

Supplementary schedules

Department of Economic Security Division of Developmental Disabilities ALTCS Contract Lag report for institutional care payments Year Ended June 30, 2018

Quarter in which service was provided

Quarter of payment	Current	1 st Prior	2 nd Prior	3 rd Prior	4 th Prior	5 th Prior	6 th Prior	Total
Current	\$ 6,144,039	\$ 2,359,362	\$ 216,654	\$ 121,911	\$ 88,015	\$ 16,746	\$ 25,418	\$ 8,972,145
1 st Prior		6,210,737	1,936,326	43,934	3,788	1,646	33,383	8,229,814
2 nd Prior			6,221,897	2,315,119	639,261	330,357	21,346	9,527,980
3 rd Prior				6,570,119	1,873,891	89,738	1,802	8,535,550
4 th Prior					6,179,928	2,151,398	63,914	8,395,240
5 th Prior						6,302,347	2,056,865	8,359,212
6 th Prior					<u> </u>		5,882,133	5,882,133
Total	6,144,039	8,570,099	8,374,877	9,051,083	8,784,883	8,892,232	8,084,861	57,902,074
Expenses reported	9,617,829	7,532,444	8,321,525	8,735,881	8,574,217	8,643,882	7,956,821	59,382,599
Adjustment (1)	(2,005,999)	1,523,423	206,105	354,525	239,791	248,350	128,040	694,235
Remaining liability	\$ 1,467,791	\$ 485,768	\$ 152,753	\$ 39,323	\$ 29,125	<u> </u>	\$ -	\$ 2,174,760

⁽¹⁾ Adjustment amounts each quarter fluctuate because of unpredictable variables that affect the business cycle.

Department of Economic Security Division of Developmental Disabilities ALTCS Contract Lag report for home- and community-based services payments Year Ended June 30, 2018

Quarter in which service was provided

Quarter of payment	Current	1 st Prior	2 nd Prior	3 rd Prior	4 th Prior	5 th Prior	6 th Prior	Total
Current	\$ 181,744,309	\$ 86,901,612	\$ 1,845,854	\$ 587,020	\$ 78,318	\$ (10,547)	\$ (16,069)	\$ 271,130,497
1 st Prior		171,646,344	81,364,627	1,424,092	297,769	105,696	21,389	254,859,917
2 nd Prior			173,482,563	80,956,063	1,619,537	462,869	165,767	256,686,799
3 rd Prior				172,455,986	82,089,431	1,355,751	465,007	256,366,175
4 th Prior					163,371,297	85,439,658	944,571	249,755,526
5 th Prior						151,010,185	72,571,679	223,581,864
6 th Prior			<u> </u>				147,832,948	147,832,948
Total	181,744,309	258,547,956	256,693,044	255,423,161	247,456,352	238,363,612	221,985,292	1,660,213,726
Expenses reported	282,916,135	274,248,124	267,599,521	255,500,969	239,990,441	231,331,456	228,569,857	1,780,156,503
Adjustment (1)	(15,144,985)	(13,205,667)	(8,492,920)	1,565,294	7,471,507	7,032,156	(6,584,565)	(27,359,180)
Remaining liability	\$ 86,026,841	\$ 2,494,501	\$ 2,413,557	\$ 1,643,102	\$ 5,596	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 92,583,597

⁽¹⁾ Adjustment amounts each quarter fluctuate because of unpredictable variables that affect the business cycle.

Department of Economic Security Division of Developmental Disabilities ALTCS Contract Lag report for acute care payments Year Ended June 30, 2018

Quarter in which service was provided

Quarter of payment	Current	1 st Prior	2 nd Prior	3 rd Prior	4 th Prior	5 th Prior	6 th Prior	Total
Current	\$ 45,193,512	\$ 839,671	\$ 498,109	\$ 750,060	\$ 9,673,942	\$ 48,154	\$ -	\$ 57,003,448
1 st Prior		51,299,308	963,263	189,513	51,355	45,838	-	52,549,277
2 nd Prior			46,599,303	963,263	189,513	51,355	45,838	47,849,272
3 rd Prior				44,011,403	887,453	786,947	279,050	45,964,853
4 th Prior					40,214,626	817,779	760,267	41,792,672
5 th Prior						45,069,107	976,311	46,045,418
6 th Prior							40,043,060	40,043,060
Total	45,193,512	52,138,979	48,060,675	45,914,239	51,016,889	46,819,180	42,104,526	331,248,000
Expenses reported (2)	50,197,796	51,299,307	47,807,372	48,000,366	47,650,515	47,495,189	42,617,969	335,068,514
Adjustment (1)	(4,045,254)	1,408,226	407,354	(2,065,501)	3,366,374	(676,009)	(513,443)	(2,118,253)
Remaining liability	\$ 959,030	\$ 568,554	\$ 154,051	\$ 20,626	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 1,702,261

⁽¹⁾ Adjustment amounts each quarter fluctuate because of unpredictable variables that affect the business cycle.

⁽²⁾ Acute Care Payments include fee for service, capitation, and reinsurance payments. Reinsurance reimbursements are not included.

Department of Economic Security Division of Developmental Disabilities ALTCS Contract Related-party transactions Year Ended June 30, 2018

Related party and relationship	Service provided	Description of transactions or payment terms agreement	Amount
Department of Economic Security, Division of Developmental Disabilities, Intermediate Care Facility/Mentally Retarded, State Facilities	Health and rehabilitative services and administrative costs	Allocated by Title XIX case management time reporting, member days count, and modified total direct costs	\$13,053,244
Department of Economic Security, Division of Developmental Disabilities, State- Operated Group Homes, Home-Based Services, State Facilities	Health and rehabilitative services and administrative costs	Allocated by Title XIX case management time reporting, member days count, and modified total direct costs	9,822,433
Department of Economic Security, Division of Developmental Disabilities and all other divisions	Administrative and fiscal services	Allocated departmental overhead costs	64,727,082
Department of Insurance	Compliance with A.R.S. §§36-2905 and 36-2944.01	Premium tax payments	29,503,761

INTERNAL CONTROL/COMPLIANCE REPORT



MELANIE M. CHESNEY
DEPUTY AUDITOR GENERAL

JOSEPH D. MOORE
DEPUTY AUDITOR GENERAL

Independent auditors' report on internal control over financial reporting and on compliance and other matters based on an audit of financial statements performed in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*

Members of the Arizona State Legislature

Michael Trailor, Director Department of Economic Security

We have audited, in accordance with U.S. generally accepted auditing standards and the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards*, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States, the financial statements of the State of Arizona, Department of Economic Security, Division of Developmental Disabilities, Arizona Long Term Care System Contract (ALTCS Contract), as of and for the year ended June 30, 2018, and the related notes to the financial statements, which collectively comprise the Division's ALTCS Contract's financial statements, and have issued our report thereon dated November 20, 2018.

Internal control over financial reporting

In planning and performing our audit of the financial statements, we considered the Division's internal control over financial reporting (internal control) to determine the audit procedures that are appropriate in the circumstances for the purpose of expressing our opinion on the Division's ALTCS Contract's financial statements, but not for the purpose of expressing an opinion on the effectiveness of the Division's internal control. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion on the effectiveness of the Division's internal control.

Our consideration of internal control was for the limited purpose described in the preceding paragraph and was not designed to identify all deficiencies in internal control that might be material weaknesses or significant deficiencies, and therefore, material weaknesses or significant deficiencies may exist that have not been identified. However, as described in the accompanying schedule of findings and recommendations, we identified certain deficiencies in internal control over financial reporting that we consider to be material weaknesses and significant deficiencies.

A deficiency in internal control exists when the design or operation of a control does not allow management or employees, in the normal course of performing their assigned functions, to prevent, or detect and correct, misstatements on a timely basis. A material weakness is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control such that there is a reasonable possibility that a material misstatement of the Division's ALTCS Contract's financial statements will not be prevented, or detected and corrected, on a timely basis. We consider the deficiency described in the accompanying schedule of findings and recommendations as item 2018-02 to be a material weakness.

A significant deficiency is a deficiency, or a combination of deficiencies, in internal control that is less severe than a material weakness, yet important enough to merit attention by those charged with governance. We consider the deficiency described in the accompanying schedule of findings and recommendations as item 2018-01 to be a significant deficiency.

Compliance and other matters

As part of obtaining reasonable assurance about whether the Division's ALTCS Contract's financial statements are free from material misstatement, we performed tests of its compliance with certain provisions of laws, regulations, contracts, and grant agreements, noncompliance with which could have a direct and material effect on the determination of financial statement amounts. However, providing an opinion on compliance with those provisions was not an objective of our audit, and accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. The results of our tests disclosed no instances of noncompliance or other matters that are required to be reported under *Government Auditing Standards*.

Department and Division response to findings

The Department and Division response to the findings identified in our audit is presented in the corrective action plan at the end of this report. The response was not subjected to the auditing procedures applied in the audit of the financial statements, and accordingly, we express no opinion on it.

Purpose of this report

The purpose of this report is solely to describe the scope of our testing of internal control and compliance and the results of that testing, and not to provide an opinion on the effectiveness of the Division's internal control or on compliance. This report is an integral part of an audit performed in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards* in considering the Division's internal control and compliance. Accordingly, this communication is not suitable for any other purpose.

Lindsey Perry, CPA, CFE Auditor General

November 20, 2018



SCHEDULE OF FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Financial statement findings

2018-01

Managing risk

Condition and context—The Department of Economic Security's (Department) process for managing its risks did not include an overall risk-assessment process that included identifying, analyzing, and responding to the department-wide information technology (IT) risks, such as potential harm from unauthorized access, use, disclosure, disruption, modification, or destruction of IT data and systems. Also, it did not include identifying, classifying, and inventorying sensitive information that might need stronger access and security controls and evaluating and determining the business functions and IT systems that would need to be restored quickly if the Department were impacted by disasters or other system interruptions.

Criteria—Effective risk management at the Department includes an entity-wide risk-assessment process that involves members of the Department's administration and IT management to determine the risks the Department faces as it seeks to achieve its objectives to not only report accurate financial information and protect its IT systems and data but to also carry out its overall mission and service objectives. The process should provide the basis for developing appropriate responses based on identified risk tolerances and specific potential risks to which the Department might be subjected. To help ensure the Department's objectives can be met, an annual risk assessment should include considering IT risks. For each identified risk, the Department should analyze the identified risk and develop a plan to respond within the context of the Department's defined objectives and risk tolerances. The risk-management process should also address the risk of unauthorized access and use, modification, or loss of sensitive information and the risk of losing the continuity of business operations in the event of a disaster or system interruption.

Effect—The Department's administration and IT management may put the Department's operations and IT systems and data at unintended and unnecessary risk.

Cause—The Department did not have adequate policies and procedures over its risk-assessment process. In addition, the Department did not complete identifying and classifying sensitive information as of June 30, 2018. Further, as of June 30, 2018, the Department did not evaluate the impact disasters or other system interruptions could have on its critical IT resources.

Recommendations—The Department should identify, analyze, and reduce risks to help prevent undesirable incidents and outcomes that could impact business functions and IT systems and data. It also should plan for where resources should be allocated and where critical controls should be implemented. To help ensure it has effective entity-wide policies and procedures to achieve these objectives, the Department should follow guidance from a credible IT security framework such as that developed by the National Institute of Standards and Technology. Responsible administrative officials and management over finance, IT, and

other entity functions should be asked for input in the Department's risk-management process. The Department should conduct the following as part of its risk-management process:

- Perform an annual entity-wide IT risk-assessment process that includes evaluating risks such as, risks
 of inappropriate access that would affect financial data, system changes that could adversely impact or
 disrupt system operations, and inadequate or outdated system security.
- Evaluate and manage the risks of holding sensitive information by identifying, classifying, and inventorying the information the Department holds to assess where stronger access and security controls may be needed to protect data in accordance with state statutes and federal regulations.
- Evaluate and determine the business functions and IT systems that would need to be restored quickly
 given the potential impact disasters or other IT system interruptions could have on critical organizational
 functions, such as public assistance, and operations, such as payroll and accounting, and determine
 how to prioritize and plan for recovery.

The Department/Division responsible officials' views and planned corrective action are in its corrective action plan included at the end of this report.

This finding is similar to prior-year finding 2017-02.

2018-02

Information technology (IT) controls—access, configuration management, security, and contingency planning

Condition and context—The Department of Economic Security's (Department) control procedures were not sufficiently designed, documented, and implemented to respond to risks associated with its information technology systems and data. The Department lacked adequate procedures over the following:

- Restricting access to its IT systems and data—Procedures did not consistently help prevent or detect unauthorized or inappropriate access.
- Configuring systems securely and managing system changes—Procedures did not ensure IT systems were securely configured.
- **Securing systems and data**—IT security policies and procedures lacked controls to prevent unauthorized or inappropriate access or use, manipulation, damage, or loss.
- **Updating a contingency plan**—Plan lacked key elements related to restoring operations in the event of a disaster or other system interruption.

Criteria—The Department should have effective internal controls to protect its IT systems and help ensure the integrity and accuracy of the data it maintains.

- Logical and physical access controls—Help to ensure systems and data are accessed by users who have a need, access granted to systems and data is appropriate, the Department monitors and reviews access to key systems and data, and the Department protects the physical access to its system infrastructure.
- **Well-defined documented configuration management process**—Ensures the Department's IT systems are configured securely. This helps limit the possibility of an adverse impact on the system security or operations.

- IT security internal control policies and procedures—Help prevent, detect, and respond to instances of unauthorized or inappropriate access or use, manipulation, damage, or loss to its IT systems and data.
- Comprehensive documented and tested contingency plan—Provides the preparation necessary to place the plan in operation and helps to ensure business operations continue and systems and data can be recovered in the event of a disaster, system or equipment failure, or other interruption.

Effect—There is an increased risk that the Department may not adequately protect its IT systems and data, which could result in unauthorized or inappropriate access and the loss of confidentiality and integrity of systems and data. It also increases the Department's risk of not being able to effectively continue daily operations and completely and accurately recover vital IT systems and data in the event of a disaster or system interruption.

Cause—The Department's policies and procedures for managing access to its IT systems and data and IT security lacked critical elements, and some written policies and procedures were not fully implemented as of June 30, 2018. The Department's configuration management policies and procedures were not fully implemented as of June 30, 2018. The Department did not have adequate policies and procedures over its contingency plan and backup processes, or procedures in place to ensure they were tested appropriately.

Recommendations—To help ensure the Department has effective policies and procedures over its IT systems and data, the Department should follow guidance from a credible IT security framework such as that developed by the National Institute of Standards and Technology. To help achieve these control objectives, the Department should develop, document, and implement control procedures in each IT control area described below:

Access

- Assign and periodically review employee user access ensuring appropriateness and compatibility with job responsibilities.
- Review all other account access to ensure it remains appropriate and necessary.
- Evaluate the use and appropriateness of accounts shared by two or more users and manage the credentials for such accounts.

Configuration and change management

- Configure IT resources appropriately and securely and maintain configuration settings.
- Manage software installed on employee computer workstations.

Security

- Perform proactive key user and system activity logging and log monitoring, particularly for users with administrative access privileges.
- Prepare and implement a security-incident-response plan making it clear how incidents should be reported and handled.
- Perform IT vulnerability scans and remediate vulnerabilities in accordance with a remediation plan.
- Identify, evaluate, and apply patches in a timely manner.

Contingency planning

- Update the contingency plan and ensure it includes all required elements to restore critical
 operations, including being prepared to enable moving critical operations to a separate alternative
 site if necessary.
- Test the contingency plan.

- Train staff responsible for implementing the contingency plan.
- Back up and securely maintain backups of systems and data.

The Department/Division responsible officials' views and planned corrective action are in its corrective action plan included at the end of this report.

This finding is similar to prior-year findings 2017-01 (access), 2017-03 (configuration management), 2017-04 (IT security), and 2017-05 (contingency planning).

DEPARTMENT/DIVISION RESPONSE



Douglas A. Ducey Governor Your Partner For A Stronger Arizona

Michael Trailor Director

November 20, 2018

Lindsey Perry Auditor General 2910 N. 44th St., Ste. 410 Phoenix, AZ 85018

Dear Ms. Perry:

We have prepared the accompanying corrective action plan as required by the standards applicable to financial audits contained in *Government Auditing Standards*. Specifically, for each finding we are providing you with our responsible officials' views, the names of the contact people responsible for corrective action, the corrective action planned, and the anticipated completion date.

Sincerely,

James C. Green, Ph.D. DDD Assistant Director

Financial statement findings

2018-01

Managing risk

Name of contact person: Todd Luther, Chief Information Security Officer

Anticipated completion date: June 30, 2019

Agency response: Concur

The Department has developed a detailed corrective action plan to address this finding and is aggressively working to correct all issues related to improving its IT risk management process. During the last several months the Department has implemented all required policies and procedures and completed a significant portion of its action plan and expects to fully implement the plan by June 30, 2019.

2018-02

Information technology (IT) controls—access, configuration management, security, and contingency planning

Name of contact person: Todd Luther, Chief Information Security Officer

Anticipated completion date: June 30, 2019

Agency response: Concur

The Department has developed a detailed corrective action plan to address this finding and is aggressively working to correct all issues related to improving its IT controls. During the last several months the Department has implemented all required policies and procedures and completed a significant portion of its action plan and expects to fully implement the plan by June 30, 2019.

